

Attachment E

PG&E's Comments on the North Fork Feather River Listing for Unknown Toxicity

WATER SEGMENT:	North Fork Feather River below Lake Almanor (The proposed 2008 listing included the entire 56+ mile stretch – without any segmentation)
POLLUTANT:	Unknown Toxicity
SOURCES:	CVRWQCB listed Confined Animal Feeding Operations (NPS) – This is <u>incorrect per correspondence with D. McClure</u> ; source should read, Unknown
STATUS of Proposed 2008 303(d) LISTING:	List (New Decision)
CVRWQCB STAFF BASIS:	After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.
PG&E RECOMMENDATION:	Revise listing as follows: <u>List the North Fork Feather River (NFFR) Big Bend Reach</u> only; do not list the remaining water segments of the NFFR.
PG&E COMMENT:	<p>The CVRWQCB listed the entire NFFR below Lake Almanor in the Seneca Reach through the Poe Reach to Lake Oroville due to exceedances of toxicity criteria, which only occurred only in samples collected from the NFFR in the Big Bend Reach downstream of the Poe Powerhouse and at the Poe Powerhouse discharge point. Toxicity data are not available below Lake Almanor through the Poe Reach upstream of Poe Powerhouse (a 48+ mile stretch of river).</p> <p>Arguments provided by PG&E in the Water Segment Delineation Fact Sheet (Attachment A) explain the necessity for determining appropriateness of listing or delisting based upon water segmentation of long rivers with regard to environmental, biological, and physical differences. PG&E believes that the TMDL process will be more reflective of current conditions and truly impaired water segments may be addressed more efficiently if water segment delineation were followed when determining the list of 303(d) impaired waters.</p> <p>In addition, listing of water segments should be based upon the location of the available data, which in this case is from a location downstream of Poe Powerhouse and does not reflect potential water quality of the 48+ miles</p>

upstream. There is no evidence and therefore, no justification in favor of placing the NFFR below Lake Almanor through the Poe Reach above Poe Powerhouse on the section 303(d) list for impaired waterbodies.

PG&E has provided factsheets for each reach of the NFFR (Seneca, Belden, Rock Creek, Cresta, Poe, and Big Bend) in this submission. The following five fact sheets demonstrate that the Seneca, Belden, Rock Creek, Cresta, and Poe reaches should not be listed for unknown toxicity because no data is available to make a determination regarding listing. The last factsheet demonstrates that the only water segment with known available data that does show possible impairment for unknown toxicity (due to an unknown source) is the Big Bend Reach downstream of Poe Powerhouse and upstream of Lake Oroville.

FACTSHEETS

**EVALUATION OF NORTH FORK FEATHER RIVER
BY SEGMENT OR REACH**

WATER SEGMENT: North Fork Feather River – Seneca Reach (between Canyon Dam and Caribou 1 and 2 powerhouses)

POLLUTANT: Unknown Toxicity

SOURCES: None; no known data or evidence available

**STATUS of Proposed
2008 303(d) LISTING:** List (New Decision)

**CVRWQCB
STAFF BASIS:** After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

**PG&E
RECOMMENDATION:** Do Not List

PG&E COMMENT: There are no known available toxicity data for the NFFR reach between Lake Almanor (Canyon Dam) and the Caribou Powerhouses 1 and 2; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.

WATER SEGMENT: North Fork Feather River – Belden Reach (between Belden Forebay and Belden Powerhouse)

POLLUTANT: Unknown Toxicity

SOURCES: None; no known data or evidence available

**STATUS of Proposed
2008 303(d) LISTING:** List (New Decision)

**CVRWQCB
STAFF BASIS:** After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

**PG&E
RECOMMENDATION:** Do Not List

PG&E COMMENT: There are no known available toxicity data for the NFFR reach between Belden Forebay and Belden Powerhouse; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.

WATER SEGMENT:	North Fork Feather River – Rock Creek Reach (between Rock Creek Reservoir and Rock Creek Powerhouse)
POLLUTANT:	Unknown Toxicity
SOURCES:	None; no known data or evidence available
STATUS of Proposed 2008 303(d) LISTING:	List (New Decision)
CVRWQCB STAFF BASIS:	After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.
PG&E RECOMMENDATION:	<u>Do Not List</u>
PG&E'S COMMENT:	There are no known available toxicity data from the Rock Creek river segment; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.

WATER SEGMENT: North Fork Feather River – Cresta Reach (between Cresta Reservoir and Cresta Powerhouse)

POLLUTANT: Unknown Toxicity

SOURCES: None; no known data or evidence available

**STATUS of Proposed
2008 303(d) LISTING:** List (New Decision)

**CVRWQCB
STAFF BASIS:** After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

**PG&E
RECOMMENDATION:** Do Not List

PG&E’S COMMENT: There are no known available toxicity data from the Cresta river segment; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.

WATER SEGMENT: North Fork Feather River – Poe Reach (between Poe Reservoir and Poe Powerhouse)

POLLUTANT: Unknown Toxicity

SOURCES: None; no known data or evidence available

**STATUS of Proposed
2008 303(d) LISTING:** List (New Decision)

**CVRWQCB
STAFF BASIS:** After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

**PG&E
RECOMMENDATION:** Do Not List

PG&E’S COMMENT: There are no known available toxicity data from the Poe river segment upstream of Poe Powerhouse; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.

WATER SEGMENT: North Fork Feather River – Big Bend Reach (Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville)

POLLUTANT: Unknown Toxicity

SOURCES: Source Unknown

**STATUS of Proposed
2008 303(d) LISTING:** List (New Decision)

**CVRWQCB
STAFF BASIS:** After review of the available data and information, Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB) staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should be placed on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

**PG&E
RECOMMENDATION:** List (this river segment only)

PG&E'S COMMENT: The CVRWQCB listed 56+ miles of the NFFR below Lake Almanor, including this river segment based upon data provided in the Department of Water Resources (DWR) Oroville Project (FERC 2100) Relicensing Report entitled, *Project Effects on Water Quality Designated Beneficial Uses for Surface Waters (Study Plan W1)*, Draft Final Report, September 2004.

Refer to the Water Segment Delineation Fact Sheet for discussion regarding the importance of reviewing known available data by water segment to determine listing status for specific water segments on the 303(d) list (Attachment A).

DWR collected grab samples of ambient water in 2002 and 2003 to test aquatic toxicity from two locations on the NFFR upstream from Lake Oroville (at the Poe Powerhouse discharge, and NFFR downstream of Poe Powerhouse). Results indicated that 2 of 18 samples were toxic for survival and exceeded the narrative toxicity objective of the Basin Plan (2 of 9 from the NFFR downstream from Poe Powerhouse zero of 9 from the Poe Powerhouse discharge).

In addition, 8 of 18 samples tested with *Ceriodaphnia dubia* exhibited reproductive toxicity and violated the narrative toxicity objective of the Basin Plan (5 of 10 samples from the NFFR downstream of Poe Powerhouse; and 3 of 8 samples from the Poe

Powerhouse Discharge).

Therefore, based on the known available information, the only water segment that should be listed for unknown toxicity (due to an unknown source) is the Big Bend Reach from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville.

References

Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board (CVRWQCB). 2007. Water Quality Control Plan (Basin Plan) for the California Regional Water Quality Control Board – Central Valley Region.

Department of Water Resources (DWR). 2004. *Project Effects on Water Quality Designated Beneficial Uses for Surface Waters (Study Plan W1), Oroville Facilities Relicensing, (FERC 2100)*. September 2004.